



Trafficking in Persons in Latin America and the Caribbean

Clare Ribando Seelke
Specialist in Latin American Affairs

December 9, 2010

Congressional Research Service

7-5700

www.crs.gov

RL33200

Summary

Trafficking in persons (TIP) for the purpose of exploitation is a lucrative criminal activity that is of major concern to the United States and the international community. According to the most recent U.S. State Department estimates, roughly 800,000 people are trafficked across borders each year. If trafficking within countries is included in the total world figures, official U.S. estimates are that some 2 million to 4 million people are trafficked annually. While most trafficking victims still appear to originate from South and Southeast Asia or the former Soviet Union, human trafficking is also a growing problem in Latin America. The International Organization for Migration (IOM) has estimated that sex trafficking in Latin America generates some \$16 billion worth of business annually.

Countries in Latin America serve as source, transit, and destination countries for trafficking victims. Latin America is a primary source region for people trafficked to the United States. As many as 17,500 are trafficked into the United States each year, according to State Department estimates. In FY2009, primary countries of origin for the 333 foreign trafficking victims certified as eligible to receive U.S. assistance included Mexico, Guatemala, Haiti, and the Dominican Republic (along with India, the Philippines, and Thailand).

Since enactment of the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 (P.L. 106-386), successive Administrations and Congress have taken steps to address human trafficking. In December 2008, the 110th Congress passed The William Wilberforce Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2008 (P.L. 110-457). The act, among other provisions, authorized TIP appropriations for FY2008 through FY2011. Obligations for U.S.-funded anti-TIP programs in Latin America totaled roughly \$17.3 million in FY2009, up from \$13.7 million in FY2008.

On June 14, 2010, the State Department issued its 10th annual, congressionally mandated report on human trafficking. In addition to outlining major trends and ongoing challenges in combating TIP, the report categorizes countries into four “tiers” according to the government’s efforts to combat trafficking. Those countries that do not cooperate in the fight against trafficking (Tier 3) have been made subject to U.S. foreign assistance sanctions. While Cuba and the Dominican Republic are the only Latin American countries ranked on Tier 3 in this year’s TIP report, nine other countries in the region — Barbados, Belize, Guatemala, Guyana, Nicaragua, Panama, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, Trinidad and Tobago, and Venezuela — are on the Tier 2 Watch List. Unless those countries make significant progress in the next six months, they could receive a Tier 3 ranking in the 2011 report.

The 112th Congress may continue to exercise its oversight of TIP programs and operations, including U.S.-funded programs in Latin America. Congress may consider increasing funding for anti-TIP programs in the region, possibly through the Mérida Initiative for Mexico, the Central America Regional Security Initiative (CARSI) or through other assistance programs. Congress may also monitor new trends in human trafficking in the region, such as the increasing involvement of Mexican drug trafficking organizations in TIP and the problem of child trafficking in Haiti, which has worsened since that country experienced a devastating earthquake on January 12, 2010. Another issue of interest may be whether sufficient efforts are being applied to address all forms of TIP in Latin America, including not only sexual exploitation, but also forced labor. For more general information on human trafficking, see CRS Report RL34317, *Trafficking in Persons: U.S. Policy and Issues for Congress*, by Liana Sun Wyler and Alison Siskin.

Contents

Background	1
Definition	1
Trafficking vs. Human Smuggling.....	1
Trafficking and Illegal Immigration.....	2
Global Figures on Trafficking	3
Human Trafficking in Latin America and the Caribbean	4
Factors that Contribute to Human Trafficking in the Region	4
Child Trafficking.....	5
Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation	6
Trafficking for Forced Labor.....	7
Relationship to Organized Crime and Terrorism	8
Trafficking and HIV/AIDS	8
U.S. Policy.....	9
Anti-Trafficking Legislation.....	9
Trafficking in Persons Reports and Sanctions: Latin America	10
U.S. Government Anti-Trafficking Programs in Latin America	11
Regional and Country Anti-Trafficking Efforts	11
Organization of American States	11
Inter-American Development Bank	12
Country Efforts: Progress and Remaining Challenges	12
Issues for Policy Consideration	13
Sanctions: Are They Useful?	13
How to Measure Success.....	14
Enforcement Improvement.....	14
Forced Labor: Adequacy of Country Efforts	15
Debates About Prostitution and Trafficking	15
Is U.S. Anti-TIP Assistance for Latin America Sufficient?	16

Tables

Table 1. Latin America and the Relevant International Conventions on Human Trafficking	17
--	----

Contacts

Author Contact Information	19
----------------------------------	----

Background

Trafficking in persons (TIP) is a growing problem in Latin America and the Caribbean, a region that contains major source, transit, and destination countries for trafficking victims. Major forms of TIP in the region now include commercial sexual exploitation of women and girls, labor trafficking within national borders (including child labor), and the trafficking of illegal immigrants in Mexico and Central America. Latin America is a primary source region for people that are trafficked to the United States, as well as for victims trafficked to Western Europe and Japan. As many as 17,500 are trafficked into the United States each year, according to State Department estimates.¹ Latin America is also a transit region for Asian victims destined for the United States, Canada, and Europe. Some of the wealthier countries in the region (such as Brazil, Costa Rica, Chile, Argentina, Panama, and Mexico) also serve as TIP destinations.

This report describes the nature and scope of the problem of trafficking in persons in Latin America and the Caribbean.² It then describes U.S. efforts to deal with trafficking in persons in the region, as well as discusses the successes and failures of some recent country and regional anti-trafficking efforts. The report concludes by raising issues that may be helpful for Congress to consider as it continues to address human trafficking as part of its authorization, appropriations, and oversight activities.

Definition

Severe forms of trafficking in persons have been defined in U.S. law as “sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or ... the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.”³ Most members of the international community agree that the trafficking term applies to all cases of this nature involving minors whether a child was taken forcibly or voluntarily.

Trafficking vs. Human Smuggling

In 2000, the United Nations drafted two protocols, known as the Palermo Protocols, to deal with trafficking in persons and human smuggling.⁴ Trafficking in persons is often confused with human smuggling. This confusion has been particularly common among Latin American officials.⁵ Alien smuggling involves the provision of a service, generally procurement of

¹ This figure was cited in the U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report 2006*, June 5, 2006. More recent TIP reports do not include estimates of the number of people trafficked into the United States.

² For more general information on human trafficking, see CRS Report RL34317, *Trafficking in Persons: U.S. Policy and Issues for Congress*.

³ *Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA)* (P.L. 106-386).

⁴ The United Nations Convention Against Organized Crime and Its Protocols, available at http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/crime_cicp_convention.html.

⁵ The most accurate phrase in Spanish for referring to human trafficking is *la trata de personas* (the trade of people), rather than the commonly used phrase *el tráfico de personas* (the traffic of people), which means something akin to human smuggling. See: U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report*, June 2009, available at <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/>.

transport, to people who knowingly consent to that service in order to gain illegal entry into a foreign country. It ends with the arrival of the migrant at his or her destination. The Trafficking Protocol considers people who have been trafficked, who are assumed to be primarily women and children, as “victims” who are entitled to protection and a broad range of social services from governments. In contrast, the Smuggling Protocol considers people who have been smuggled as willing participants in a criminal activity who should be given “humane treatment and full protection of their rights” while being returned to their country of origin.⁶

Many observers contend that smuggling is a “crime against the state” and that smuggled migrants should be immediately deported, while trafficking is a “crime against a person” whose victims deserve to be given government assistance and protection. The Department of Justice asserts that the existence of “force, fraud, or coercion” is what distinguishes trafficking from human smuggling.⁷ Under U.S. immigration law, a trafficked migrant is a victim, while an illegal alien who consents to be smuggled is complicit in a criminal activity and may therefore be subject to prosecution and deportation.

Trafficking and Illegal Immigration

Incidences of human trafficking are often affected by migration flows, particularly when those flows are illegal and unregulated. In recent years, several factors have influenced emigration flows from Latin America and the Caribbean. Whereas a large percentage of emigrants from Latin America during the 1980s were refugees fleeing from the conflicts in Central America, a majority of the region’s more recent emigrants have been economic migrants in search of better paying jobs in developed countries.⁸ Primary destination countries for Latin American immigrants have included Spain, Italy, Canada, the Netherlands, Britain, and the United States. These countries, many with low birth rates and aging populations, have come to rely on migrant laborers from Latin America to fill low-paying jobs in agriculture, construction, manufacturing, and domestic service. At the same time, concerns about security and other issues related to absorbing large numbers of foreign-born populations have led many developed countries to tighten their immigration policies. These factors have led to a global rise in illegal immigration.

In the Western Hemisphere, illegal migration flows have been most evident in Mexico, particularly along its 1,951-mile northern border with the United States and its southern border with Guatemala (596 miles) and Belize (155 miles). Between 2002 and 2005, for example, the number of non-Mexican illegal migrants apprehended along the U.S.-Mexico border more than tripled.⁹ Since 2007, however, both the estimated number of unauthorized immigrants entering the United States from Latin American countries other than Mexico and the size of the unauthorized population from those countries living in the United States have declined. The size of the Mexican unauthorized immigrant population living in the United States appears to have leveled off rather than declined, even though unauthorized migration flows from Mexico to the United States have decreased since mid-decade.¹⁰

⁶ http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/crime_cicp_convention.html.

⁷ U.S. Department of Justice, Human Smuggling and Trafficking Center, “Fact Sheet: Distinctions Between Human Smuggling and Human Trafficking,” January 2005.

⁸ There are several exceptions to this general rule, including emigrants fleeing from Cuba and Colombia.

⁹ “Life on a Trouble Frontier,” *Fort Worth Star-Telegram*, June 4, 2006.

¹⁰ Jeffrey S. Passel and D’Vera Cohn, *U.S. Unauthorized Immigration Flows Are Down Sharply Since Mid-Decade*, (continued...)

As U.S. immigration and border restrictions have tightened, illegal immigrants have increasingly turned to smugglers to lead them through Mexico and across the U.S.-Mexico border. In order to avoid detection by U.S. border patrol agents, smuggling routes have become more dangerous and therefore more costly. Some smugglers have sold undocumented migrants into situations of forced labor or prostitution in order to recover their costs. Recent studies illustrate how illegal immigrants transiting Mexico, many of whom lack legal protection because of their immigration status, have become increasingly vulnerable to human trafficking and other abuses.¹¹ An increasing percentage of abuses, the most violent case of which resulted in the mass murder of 72 U.S.-bound migrants in Tamaulipas in late August 2010, have been perpetrated by criminal gangs and drug traffickers, sometimes with assistance from public officials.¹²

Global Figures on Trafficking

TIP is considered to be one of today's leading criminal enterprises and is believed to affect virtually all countries around the globe. According to the United Nations, governments reported the trafficking of people originating from 127 countries and exploited in 137 countries worldwide from 1996 to 2003.¹³ Despite limited data on the nature and severity of the problem, the U.S. government has estimated that roughly 800,000 people are trafficked across borders each year.¹⁴ If trafficking within countries is included in the total world figures, official U.S. estimates are that 2 million to 4 million people are trafficked annually. The International Labor Organization (ILO) estimates that there are at least 2.4 million trafficked persons at any given moment, generating profits as high as \$32 billion (USD).¹⁵ The accuracy of these and other estimates, however, has been questioned.

The U.S. Government Accountability Office (GAO) released a report in 2006 casting doubt on the methodology and reliability of official U.S. government figures. It concluded that the "U.S. government has not yet established an effective mechanism for estimating the number of victims or for conducting ongoing analysis of trafficking related data."¹⁶ Figures provided by other international organizations are unlikely to be any more accurate.

Trafficking in persons affects nearly every country and region in the world. Internal trafficking generally flows from rural to urban or tourist centers within a given country, while trafficking across international borders generally flows from developing to developed nations. Countries are generally described as source, transit, or destination countries for TIP victims. Many experts conclude that a country is more likely to become a source of human trafficking if it has recently

others have warned that there is likely to be a significant increase in trafficking worldwide as a result of the increased poverty and unemployment brought on by the global financial crisis.¹⁷ The United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) and others have warned that the hundreds of thousands of Haitian children who were orphaned or abandoned after a catastrophic earthquake hit that country in January 2010 are particularly vulnerable to human trafficking.¹⁸

Studies have found that human trafficking disproportionately affects women and girls. A 2009 U.N. Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) study found that, on average, 65%-75% of human trafficking victims are women and 15%-25% are minors.¹⁹ The ILO estimates women and girls account for 56% of victims in forced economic exploitation, such as domestic service, agricultural work, and manufacturing—and 98% of victims in forced commercial sexual exploitation.²⁰ The vulnerability of women and girls is due to a number of factors in source, transit, and destination countries.²¹

Human Trafficking in Latin America and the Caribbean

Human trafficking is a growing problem in Latin America and the Caribbean. IOM has estimated that sex trafficking in Latin America now generates some \$16 billion worth of business annually. Internal trafficking for forced and child labor is widespread in many countries in the region. In addition, the U.S. State Department has identified several countries as major source, transit, and destination countries for victims of transnational TIP. Those countries include:

- **Source countries:** Colombia, Dominican Republic, Guatemala, Haiti, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua, and Paraguay
- **Transit countries:** All of Central America and the Caribbean
- **Destination countries:** Argentina, Bahamas, Barbados, Brazil, Chile, Costa Rica, Mexico, Netherland Antilles, Panama, St. Lucia, and Trinidad and Tobago.²²

Factors that Contribute to Human Trafficking in the Region

Both individual factors and outside circumstances contribute to human trafficking within and from Latin America and the Caribbean. Individual risk factors include poverty, unemployment,

¹⁷ International Labor Organization (ILO), *The Cost of Coercion*, May 2009.

¹⁸ United Nations Children’s Emergency Fund (UNICEF), *Children of Haiti: Milestones and Looking Forward at Six Months*, July 2010; Gerardo Reyes and Jacqueline Charles, “Trafficking, Sexual Exploitation of Haitian Children in the Dominican Republic on the Rise,” *Miami Herald*, October 23, 2010.

¹⁹ UNODC and the United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UNGIFT), *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, February 2009.

²⁰ ILO, *A Global Alliance Against Forced Labor*, 2005.

²¹

illiteracy, history of physical or sexual abuse, homelessness, drug use, and gang membership. The IOM in Colombia has identified some personal characteristics common among trafficking victims. These include a tendency to take risks in order to fulfill one's goals, a focus on short-term rewards that may result from short-term risks, and a lack of familial support and/or strong social networks.²³ These risk factors that may "push" an individual towards accepting a risky job proposition in another country have been compounded by "pull" factors, including the hope of finding economic opportunity abroad, which is fueled by television and internet images of wealth in the United States and Europe.

Outside factors contributing to human trafficking include the following: (1) the high global demand for domestic servants, agricultural laborers, sex workers, and factory labor; (2) political, social, or economic crises, as well as natural disasters occurring in particular countries, such as the recent earthquake in Haiti; (3) lingering *machismo* (chauvinistic attitudes and practices) that tends to lead to discrimination against women and girls; (4) existence of established trafficking networks with sophisticated recruitment methods; (5) public corruption, especially complicity between law enforcement and border agents with traffickers and alien smugglers; (6) restrictive immigration policies in some destination countries that have limited the opportunities for legal migration flows to occur; (7) government disinterest in the issue of human trafficking; and (8) limited economic opportunities for women in Latin America. Although women have achieved the same (or higher) educational levels as men in many countries, women's employment continues to be concentrated in low-wage, informal sector jobs.

Child Trafficking

There is considerably less research on the extent and nature of trafficking in persons in Latin America and the Caribbean than there is on Asia and Europe. Most of the research that does exist has focused, at least until recently, on trafficking in children for sexual exploitation. Trafficking of children for sexual exploitation is most common in countries that are both popular tourist destinations and centers of sex tourism.²⁴ This problem is exacerbated by the fact that most countries in the region have legislation establishing (on average) 14 years of age as the legal age of consent to work. The available data show that the number of children (girls and boys) sexually exploited in the region is increasing while the average age of exploited children is decreasing.²⁵

Although street and orphaned children are particularly vulnerable to trafficking into the sex industry, a large percentage of children who have been trafficked remain living with their families and engage in commercial sex activity in order to contribute to household income. One study of child prostitutes in El Salvador found that 57% of those interviewed lived with their parents or other close relatives.²⁶ Other factors associated with children at risk of trafficking include poverty, infrequent school attendance, physical or sexual abuse, drug or alcohol addiction, and involvement in a criminal youth gang.

²³ Sanin et al., "Condiciones de Vulnerabilidad a la Trata de Personas en Colombia," IOM, 2005.

²⁴ The State Department has identified Brazil, Costa Rica, the Dominican Republic, Honduras, Jamaica, Mexico, and Nicaragua as countries with significant child sex tourism industries. G-TIP, Power Point Presentation from Briefing on TIP in the Western Hemisphere, July 2009.

²⁵ Pamela Coffey et al., *Literature Review of Trafficking in Persons in Latin America and the Caribbean*, Development Alternatives, Inc (DAI) for the U.S. Agency for International Development, August 2004.

²⁶ Zoila Gonzalez de Innocenti, *Explotación Sexual Comercial de Niñas y Adolescentes: Una Evaluación Rápida*, ILO/IPEC, 2002.

In addition to sexual exploitation, Latin American children have been trafficked for illegal adoptions, for use as soldiers in armed conflict, and to work for organized criminal groups. Guatemala has been among the largest source countries of children kidnapped and trafficked internationally for adoption.²⁷ The Colombian government has estimated that, although more than 3,000 child soldiers have been disarmed and demobilized, another 6,000 Colombian children may still be working as combatants for paramilitary and guerrilla groups.²⁸ In addition to the recruitment of child soldiers for armed conflict, some countries, such as Brazil and Mexico, are facing increasing instances of youth trafficked by drug gangs into urban warfare.

Children are also trafficked both internally and across international borders for use as domestic servants. State Department officials have estimated that as many as 1 million children work as domestic servants in Latin America, many of whom are vulnerable to verbal, physical, and sexual abuse.²⁹ Abuse has been particularly evident among the 225,000 or so *restaveks* (child domestic servants) in Haiti and the 3,000 Haitian *restaveks* living and working in the Dominican Republic.³⁰

Finally, the ILO and the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL) have documented instances from across the region of children forced to work under dangerous circumstances in agricultural or mining industries. A 2006 ILO report found that the number of children working in Latin America and the Caribbean, many of whom may have been trafficked for forced labor, fell by two-thirds between 2000 and 2004, faster than any other region in the world.³¹ However, a September 2009 DOL report found continued evidence of the use of child labor in the production of a wide range of goods in many countries in Latin America. Examples of some of the goods cited in that report include bricks, gold, coffee, sugarcane, and other agro-export crops.³²

Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation

While trafficking for forced labor is a serious problem in Latin America and the Caribbean, trafficking for sexual exploitation has been perceived as a more widespread and pressing regional problem.³³ Most victims are trafficked for prostitution, but others are used for pornography and stripping. Children tend to be trafficked within their own countries, while young women may be trafficked internally or internationally, sometimes with the consent of their husbands or other family members. One study estimated that some 10,000 women from southern and central

²⁷ The Guatemalan government has taken steps to reduce illegal international adoptions from Guatemala since signing the Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption in 2007.

²⁸ This estimate, cited in the State Department's 2009 TIP report, is substantially lower than an estimate cited in the 2004 Child Soldiers Global Report published by the Coalition to Stop the Use of Child Soldiers. That report found that some 11,000 to 14,000 Colombian youth had been forcibly recruited as child soldiers. For information on the Disarmament, Demobilization, Rehabilitation, and Reintegration program in Colombia, see Care International, "Overcoming Lost Childhoods," January 2008.

²⁹ Interview with representative from the Global Office to Monitor Trafficking in Persons, U.S. Department of State, September 29, 2005.

³⁰ U.S. Department of State, *TIP Report*, June 2010.

³¹ "The End of Child Labor: Within Reach," International Labor Organization, May 2006.

³² U.S. Department of Labor (DOL), *The DOL's List of Goods Produced by Child Labor or Forced Labor*, September 2009.

³³ Laura Langberg, "A Review of Recent OAS Research on Human Trafficking in the Latin American and Caribbean Region," in *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey*, IOM, 2005.

Mexico are trafficked for sexual exploitation to the northern border region each year.³⁴ The State Department has estimated that at least 100,000 Latin Americans are trafficked internationally each year, with large numbers of victims coming from Colombia and the Dominican Republic, among others. It has identified Spain, Italy, Portugal, the United States, and Japan as major destination countries for Latin American trafficking victims.³⁵

There are also intra-regional trafficking problems. A 2005 report by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) asserts that the Caribbean's relatively open borders, lax enforcement of entertainment visa and work permit rules, and legalized prostitution have contributed to the problem of trafficking there.³⁶ Argentina and Brazil are destination countries for women trafficked from the Andes and Caribbean countries like the Dominican Republic. Panama has been a destination for women from Colombia and Central America trafficked to work in the sex industry. Trafficking has also occurred at border crossings throughout Central America and Mexico, especially the Mexico-Guatemala border, as undocumented women who have not been able to get to the United States end up being forced into prostitution.

Trafficking for Forced Labor

The ILO reports that trafficking victims comprise 20% (or 250,000) of the 1.3 million people in Latin America engaged in forced labor. These numbers do not include the increasing numbers of Latin Americans who have ended up in situations of forced labor after migrating to Europe or the United States. Despite the relatively large number of victims trafficked for forced labor in the region, there are relatively few studies on this topic.

Between 1995 and 2008, the Brazilian government has rescued more than 30,000 laborers from situations of forced labor.³⁷

Peru, Bolivia, and Paraguay are particularly at risk of being trafficked for forced labor.³⁹ Each year, thousands of migrants flock from Haiti to the Dominican Republic to work in the construction, tourism, and agriculture industries, as well as in the informal sector. Many of those migrants lack proper documentation, rendering them vulnerable to trafficking and other abuses.

In the past few years, the Department of Justice has prosecuted an increasingly large volume of cases of foreigners trafficked into forced labor in the United States. Although the majority of these cases have involved trafficking for prostitution, a significant number have involved the agricultural sector. Annually some 1.5 million seasonal farm workers, mostly from Latin America and the Caribbean, plant and harvest produce in the United States. Low wages, harsh working conditions, and a lack of legal protection, combined with an ever increasing demand for cheap labor, have resulted in growing numbers of forced labor abuses.

Relationship to Organized Crime and Terrorism

In many parts of the world, trafficking in money, weapons, and people is largely conducted by criminal gangs or mafia groups. Human trafficking can be a lucrative way for organized criminal groups to fund other illicit activities. In Latin America, Mexican drug cartels are increasingly involved in the trafficking of people as well as drugs.⁴⁰ According to the Bilateral Safety Corridor Coalition (BSCC), criminal gangs from Mexico, Central America, Russia, Japan, Ukraine and several other countries have been caught attempting to traffic victims across the U.S.-Mexico border. During congressional testimony, one expert on security issues in Latin America identified human trafficking as the second most serious organized criminal threat to Central America (behind drug trafficking).⁴¹

Some analysts maintain that criminals involved in human trafficking could eventually form ties with terrorist groups, such as Al Qaeda, thereby threatening regional security, although there has been no evidence of this to date. They argue that, just as terrorists have engaged in drug trafficking in Colombia and the Tri-Border region (Argentina, Brazil and Paraguay), they may increasingly turn to human trafficking to fund their networks and operations. Others contend that trafficking is a type of “disorganized crime” in which traffickers are generally individuals or small groups that collaborate on an ad-hoc basis, rather than a big business controlled by organized crime.

Trafficking and HIV/AIDS

One of the serious public health effects of human trafficking is the risk of victims contracting and transmitting HIV/AIDS and other diseases. On the global level, women engaged in prostitution, whether voluntarily or not, have a high prevalence of HIV/AIDS. Some experts have noted that

³⁹ For information on ILO research and programs in these countries, see http://www.ilo.org/sapfl/Projects/lang--en/WCMS_082040/index.htm. See also “U.N. Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues Calls for Urgent Action to Stop Forced Labor in Bolivia, Paraguay,” *Targeted News Service*, August 31, 2009. Trip reports available at <http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/>.

⁴⁰ “Mexico on the Brink,” *Guardian Unlimited*, July 28, 2009; Melissa Graham, “Mexico’s New War: Sex Trafficking,” *La Prensa San Diego*, October 29, 2010.

⁴¹ Testimony of Eric L. Olson, Senior Advisor, Security Initiative, Woodrow Wilson Center, before the House Subcommittee on National Security and Foreign Affairs, October 1, 2009.

human trafficking may be linked to the spread and mutation of the AIDS virus. Research in Latin America and the Caribbean has shown that trafficking victims, along with other irregular migrants, are at high risk of contracting HIV/AIDS. Factors that put these groups at risk include poverty, discrimination, exploitation, lack of legal protection and education, cultural biases, and limited access to health services.

U.S. Policy

Anti-Trafficking Legislation⁴²

Anti-TIP efforts have accelerated in the United States since the enactment of the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA, P.L. 106-386). The TVPA established

Trafficking in Persons Reports and Sanctions: Latin America

On June 14, 2010, the State Department issued its 10th annual report on human trafficking, *Trafficking in Persons Report (TIP), June 2010*, as mandated by the TVPA (P.L. 106-386 as amended). The 2010 TIP report is more comprehensive than prior reports, ranking 177 countries as compared to 173 countries in the 2009 report. It is also unique in that it provides a description and ranking of U.S. efforts to combat human trafficking. The report also discusses trafficking in persons in two “special case” countries—Haiti and Somalia—where sufficient information was not available to provide a ranking.

As in previous years, most Latin American countries fall somewhere in the middle of the tier rankings, with 15 countries on Tier 2, and nine on the Tier 2 Watch List. Cuba and the Dominican Republic are the only two Latin American countries identified as Tier 3 and made subject to possible U.S. trafficking-related sanctions, while Colombia is the only country in the region to earn a Tier 1 ranking.⁴³ Countries on the Tier 2 Watch List include Barbados, Belize, Guatemala, Guyana, Nicaragua, Panama, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, Trinidad and Tobago, and Venezuela. The State Department must submit an interim report by February 2011 on the Tier 2 Watch List countries in advance of the next TIP report.

According to the 2010 TIP report, while some countries made substantial progress in combating human trafficking, others lagged behind. Argentina upgraded its tier ranking by securing convictions under its 2008 TIP law and improving programs to identify and serve TIP victims. In contrast, the Dominican Republic fell to Tier 3 for failing to convict any TIP offenders and for its limited efforts to protect TIP victims. Barbados fell to the Tier 2 Watch List for failing to show progress in initiating any TIP cases. Panama was also downgraded to the Watch List for failing to provide adequate assistance and protection for TIP victims and for weak anti-TIP law enforcement efforts. Several other countries remained on the Tier 2 Watch List, including Belize, Guatemala, Guyana, Nicaragua, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, and Venezuela.

On September 13, 2010, President Obama issued his determination on whether to impose aid restrictions during FY2011 on the 13 listed Tier 3 countries from the 2010 TIP report, issued in June.⁴⁴ The President has the option to (1) apply a full prohibition against nonhumanitarian and nontrade-related foreign assistance, (2) withhold a portion of aid eligible for restriction by granting partial waivers, or (3) waive the restrictions entirely on the basis of national interest reasons.

For FY2011 the President determined that nonhumanitarian and nontrade-related foreign assistance would be fully withheld from two countries: Eritrea and North Korea. Four countries were granted by the President partial waivers from the aid prohibitions: Burma, Cuba, Iran, and Zimbabwe. Seven countries—the Democratic Republic of Congo, the Dominican Republic, Kuwait, Mauritania, Papua New Guinea, Saudi Arabia, and Sudan—were granted by the President full waivers from the aid prohibitions. The President determined that it remained in the U.S. national interest to continue nonhumanitarian and nontrade-related foreign assistance to these countries.

⁴³ The other Tier 3 countries include Burma, Congo (DRC), Eritrea, Iran, Kuwait, Mauritania, North Korea, Papua New Guinea, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, and Zimbabwe.

⁴⁴ Barack Obama, "Presidential Determination With Respect To Foreign Governments' Efforts Regarding Trafficking In Persons," Presidential Determination 2010-15, September 13, 2010.

U.S. Government Anti-Trafficking Programs in Latin America

In FY2009, the U.S. government obligated approximately \$84.0 million in anti-trafficking

Since 2005, the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Unit has organized, facilitated and implemented training programs, promoted anti-trafficking policies, and provided opportunities for the exchange of information and best practices to assist OAS Member States in their anti-TIP efforts. The unit has developed several capacity-building programs for parliamentarians, law enforcement officials, migration officers, and consular and diplomatic representatives to prevent trafficking and to identify and protect victims of human trafficking. In recent years, the program trained more than 550 government officials from Bolivia, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Guatemala, Haiti, Honduras, Jamaica, Nicaragua, Paraguay, Peru, and Trinidad and Tobago. During 2008-2009, the unit trained over 350 United Nations peacekeeping trainers, military, and civilian police personnel from the region on anti-TIP efforts prior to their deployment. As a self-sustaining program, the Train-the-Trainers Peacekeeping Project continues to train military and civilian police prior to deployment in peacekeeping missions throughout the world.

Inter-American Development Bank

In 2004, the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) formed an internal working group to begin developing ways to support governments' anti-trafficking efforts in the region. The IDB is coordinating its efforts with the OAS and the IOM, and has developed technical cooperation projects for Bolivia, Colombia, El Salvador, Guyana, and Paraguay. The IDB is also working with the Ricky Martin Foundation to raise awareness of the extent of child trafficking in the region through public service announcements, promotional materials, and a video on best practices to combat trafficking in the region. In 2006, the bank and the foundation opened trafficking prevention hotlines (funded by IOM) in Central America, Colombia, Mexico, and Peru. As of July 2009, those hotlines had received more than 12,000 calls and led to the initiation of at least 175 police investigations and the rescue of at least 30 TIP victims.⁴⁵

Country Efforts: Progress and Remaining Challenges

Over the last few years, most Latin American countries, perhaps motivated by international pressure or the threat of U.S. sanctions, have taken steps to address the growing problem of human trafficking. As evidenced in **Table 1**, a majority of countries in the region have signed and ratified several international protocols in which they have pledged to combat various aspects of the trafficking problem. Those agreements include The U.N. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, ILO Conventions on Abolishing Forced Labor and the Worst Forms of Child Labor; the Optional Protocol to the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution, and Pornography; and The Optional Protocol to the CRC on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict. A number of countries, including five countries in 2008, also passed new or amended anti trafficking legislation.⁴⁶ Several countries also created National TIP Coordinators or Task Forces to coordinate anti-TIP programs and initiatives.

According to some, the general problem with the new international commitments, legal reforms, and human trafficking initiatives that have emerged in Latin America is that many countries appear to lack the resources and perhaps the political will to fund and implement their anti-

⁴⁵ "V-ME Premieres IDB Documentary on Human Trafficking," *U.S. Fed News*, July 10, 2009.

⁴⁶ Several countries in the Caribbean, Chile, Honduras, and Panama have yet to pass laws to punish forced labor trafficking.

trafficking programs. Many governments are facing other crime problems (such as drug trafficking and gang violence) which they perceive as a bigger problem than human trafficking. Sometimes country efforts are thwarted by larger problems, such as political instability, as in the cases of Haiti, Honduras, and Guatemala. Many countries have few, if any, shelters for trafficking victims and no follow-up plans to help victims after they return from overseas to their former residences. Mexico, a large middle-income country, just opened its first shelter for TIP victims. Some countries, including Guyana and Belize, have appeared to model their national TIP laws so closely to TVPA that they do not have the resources or the manpower to implement the complicated legislation. Public corruption is also a major obstacle to effective anti-trafficking programming, as there is often complicity between traffickers and corrupt border officials, customs agents, law enforcement personnel, and politicians. Finally, conviction and prosecution rates for TIP offenders are low compared to other regions, particularly for forced labor and domestic servitude crimes, but this is not surprising given the general weakness of many of the countries' police and judicial systems.

Issues for Policy Consideration

U.S. interests in Latin America are multiple and, at times, conflicting. These interests include strengthening democracy, promoting economic growth through free trade, stemming the flow of illegal narcotics and migrants, and cooperating on border security and anti-terrorism measures. These broad interests either directly or indirectly affect all U.S. policy in the region and may at times conflict with specific human rights goals, such as fighting human trafficking. As is the case with many human rights issues, ethical concerns about human trafficking must be balanced against broader U.S. geopolitical goals and interests in each country.

There are several ways in which broader U.S. foreign policy goals may influence the TIP report and sanctions process. Some observers maintain that there are certain U.S. allies in the region that could never be sanctioned for political reasons. Others contend that the repeated inclusion of Cuba and, until recently, Venezuela on the Tier 3 list has constituted “selective indignation” on the part of the U.S. government.⁴⁷ U.S. officials working in the region have noted that it is sometimes difficult to produce an unbiased account of government efforts against trafficking without being swayed by underlying foreign policy concerns. Others say that it is difficult to deal with trafficking in persons when a country is undergoing extreme political instability, and that were TIP sanctions actually enforced, that they might undermine the broader U.S. goals of preventing democratic breakdown in the hemisphere. Issues that may be considered when evaluating the implementation of U.S. anti-trafficking policies are discussed below.

Sanctions: Are They Useful?

Since 2003, no governments in Latin America except Cuba and Venezuela have been subject to partial or full sanctions for failing to meet the minimum standards of TVPA. Ecuador appeared on the Tier 3 list in both 2004 and 2005 but did not face sanctions. Some argue that sanctions will probably only be applied to countries already subject to sanctions—such as Burma, Cuba, or North Korea—and that threatening other countries with sanctions may actually encourage them to become less open to working with the United States. Others argue that this may be the case with

⁴⁷ “Politics: U.S. Trafficking Report Includes Cuba and Venezuela,” *Global Information Network*, June 10, 2005.

China or Saudi Arabia, but most Latin American countries depend on good political and economic relations with the United States and fear the public humiliation that comes with a Tier 3 designation as much as actual sanctions. For example, some believe a Tier 3 designation motivated the government of Belize to take several positive steps against trafficking in the summer of 2006. Others maintain that the progress that Belize made in 2006 has not been sustained, noting that the country received a Tier 2 Watch List rating in the 2009 and 2010 TIP reports.

How to Measure Success

It is often difficult to measure success in the fight against human trafficking. Many countries in Latin America have reported increases in the number of training courses provided, conferences held, and workshops convened as evidence of their commitment to combat human trafficking. However, as stated in the 2009 TIP report, the State Department prefers countries to focus on “concrete actions” when determining the adequacy of a particular country’s anti-TIP efforts. “Concrete actions” include enacting new or amended TIP legislation; expanding victim assistance and prevention programs; and, perhaps most importantly, securing prosecutions, convictions, and prison sentences for TIP offenders. While many countries in Latin America have passed or amended their existing TIP laws, until very recently, the number of TIP-related arrests, prosecutions, and convictions remained low in comparison to other regions. Some have questioned the adequacy of the State Department’s indicators, asserting that more credit should be given to countries that are seeking to address the underlying factors that put people at risk for trafficking, such as gender and racial discrimination, violence against women and children, and economic inequality.⁴⁸

Enforcement Improvement

In 2009, there were 647 prosecutions of suspected traffickers and 553 convictions in Latin America. These figures represent a significant improvement over 2008, when there were 448 prosecutions and 161 convictions in the region. They still pale in comparison to Europe, with 2,208 prosecutions and 1,733 convictions in 2009. They also pale in comparison to the number of reported victims both in Latin America and globally.

In order to continue improving enforcement of TIP legislation in Latin America, some observers have urged U.S. officials and other donors not to encourage countries to pass laws modeled entirely after those from other countries (such as the TVPA). Instead, countries should be given time to develop trafficking laws that respond to their particular TIP problems and law enforcement capacities. Once legislation is in place, more attention and resources may be needed to help countries implement that legislation, and that assistance may need to go beyond training for law enforcement and legal professionals. Third, attention may be needed to address the issue of police corruption that has long plagued many countries in the hemisphere. This could be addressed by stiffening penalties for police, border guards, or other officials caught assisting traffickers.

⁴⁸ David E. Guinn, “Defining the Problem of Trafficking: the Interplay of U.S. Law, Donor, and NGO Engagement and the Local Context in Latin America,” *Human Rights Quarterly*, 30 (2008).

Forced Labor: Adequacy of Country Efforts

Recent research suggests that while TIP for sexual exploitation is both a highly prevalent and particularly visible form of human trafficking, TIP for forced labor exploitation may account for a large, often unreported and possibly growing share of TIP globally. Recent interest in forced labor as a form of TIP has sparked calls for greater research in analyzing the prevalence of forced labor, increased international efforts to combat this form of TIP, and more awareness to prevent and educate potential victims. The State Department's TIP reports since 2005 have placed an added emphasis on evaluating country efforts to combat trafficking for forced labor, and several other programmatic efforts to combat TIP for forced labor are underway at the State Department. Other international groups, particularly the ILO, also play a large role in efforts to combat forced labor. Within Latin America, Brazil has been singled out by the ILO for its efforts to address forced labor.⁴⁹ Across the region, labor trafficking prosecutions and convictions are increasing: from one prosecution and one conviction in the 2007 reporting period to 47 prosecutions and 66 convictions in 2009.⁵⁰ Despite this slow progress, many Latin American countries have yet to broaden their anti-TIP efforts out from focusing largely on the commercial sexual exploitation of women and children.

Debates About Prostitution and Trafficking

The current U.N. definition of TIP assumes that there are at least two different types of prostitution, one of which is the result of free choice to participate in the prostitution business while the other is the result of coercion, vulnerability, deception, or other pressures. Of these, only the latter type is considered TIP under the U.N. definition. Based on the TVPA, as amended, sex trafficking is not considered a "severe form of TIP" unless it is associated with commercial sex acts induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such acts is a minor.⁵¹

Several groups in the United States have sought to redefine TIP to include all prostitution, but many countries have thus far rejected those attempts. Proponents of this broader definition of TIP argue that prostitution is "not 'sex work;' it is violence against women [that] exists because ... men are given social, moral and legal permission to buy women on demand."⁵² Several European and Latin American countries, which have legal or government-regulated prostitution, reject such a definitional change and argue that this broader definition would impede the capacity of the international community to achieve consensus and work together to combat trafficking.

The U.S. State Department asserts that prostitution and TIP are inextricably linked. Most recently, in its 2008 TIP Report to Congress, the State Department states that "sex trafficking would not exist without the demand for commercial sex flourishing around the world" and that prostitution and any related activities "should not be regulated as a legitimate form of work for any human

⁴⁹ Patricia Trindade Maranhão Costa, "Fighting Forced Labor: The Example of Brazil," ILO Special Action Program to Combat Forced Labor, 2009.

⁵⁰ TIP Report, June 2010.

⁵¹ Sec. 103 (8-9) of P.L. 106-386, as amended.

⁵² Janice G. Raymond, "Sex Trafficking is Not 'Sex Work,'" *Conscience*, Spring 2005.

being.”⁵³ State Department officials have identified the fact that legalized prostitution fuels sex trafficking in the region as an obstacle to anti-TIP efforts in Latin America.⁵⁴

Is U.S. Anti-TIP Assistance for Latin America Sufficient?

Questions have been raised about the adequacy of U.S. anti-TIP assistance to Latin America. In FY2008 the percentage of U.S. international anti-trafficking program funds dedicated to Latin American and the Caribbean declined as compared to previous years, a trend that was reversed in FY2009. Similarly, total U.S. anti-TIP obligations for the region fell from roughly \$17.5 million in FY2006 and FY2007 to some \$13.7 million in FY2008, but rose again to some \$17.3 million in FY2009. Representatives from the State Department’s Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons have expressed hope that more anti-TIP programs in Mexico and Central America might be funded through the Mérida Initiative and the Central America Regional Security Initiative.⁵⁵ To date, Congress has appropriated roughly \$1.8 billion for the Mérida Initiative and related anti-crime and counterdrug assistance programs in Mexico, Central America, and the Caribbean. The Mérida Initiative currently does not include much funding specifically devoted to combat human trafficking aside from support for DHS’ “Operation Against Smugglers (and Traffickers) Initiative on Safety and Security” (OASISS) and funds to support a Resident Legal Adviser on TIP issues.

⁵³ U.S. Department of State, 2008 TIP Report. The 2009 TIP Report does not discuss linkages between prostitution and trafficking.

⁵⁴ U.S. Department of State, G-TIP, Power Point Presentation from Briefing on TIP in the Western Hemisphere, July 2009.

⁵⁵ U.S. Department of State, G-TIP, Power Point Presentation from Briefing on TIP in the Western Hemisphere, July 2009.

Table 1. Latin America and the Relevant International Conventions on Human Trafficking

Country	2009 Tier Placement	2010 Tier Placement	U.N. TIP Protocol		ILO Convention 105	ILO Convention 182	Optional Protocol of CRC		Optional Protocol CRC Armed Conflict	
			Signed	Ratified (a)	Ratified	Ratified	Signed	Ratified (a)	Signed	Ratified (a)
Antigua & Barbuda	Tier 2	Tier 2		X	X	X	X	X		
Argentina	Tier 2 WL	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Bahamas	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X				
Barbados	Tier 2	Tier 2 WL	X		X	X				
Belize	Tier 2 WL	Tier 2 WL		X (a)**	X	X	X	X	X	X
Bolivia	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X		X(a)
Brazil	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Chile	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Colombia	Tier 1	Tier 1	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Costa Rica	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Cuba	Tier 3	Tier 3			X		X	X	X	X
DR	Tier 2 WL	Tier 3	X	X	X	X		X(a)	X	
Ecuador	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
El Salvador	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Guatemala	Tier 2WL	Tier 2 WL		X (a)	X	X	X	X	X	X
Guyana	Tier 2 WL	Tier 2 WL		X (a)	X	X				
Haiti	Not rated	Not rated	X		X	X	X		X	
Honduras	Tier 2	Tier 2		X(a)	X	X		X (a)		X (a)
Jamaica	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X		X	X
Mexico	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Nicaragua	Tier 2 WL	Tier 2 WL		X (a)	X	X		X (a)		X(a)

Country	2009 Tier Placement	2010 Tier Placement	U.N. TIP Protocol		ILO Convention 105	ILO Convention 182	Optional Protocol of CRC		Optional Protocol CRC Armed Conflict	
			Signed	Ratified (a)	Ratified	Ratified	Signed	Ratified (a)	Signed	Ratified (a)
Panama	Tier 2	Tier 2 WL	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Paraguay	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Peru	Tier 2	Tier 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
St. Vincent & Grenadines	Tier 2 WL	Tier 2 WL	X		X	X		X (a)		
Suriname	Tier 2	Tier 2		X(a)	X	X	X		X	
Venezuela	Tier 2 WL	Tier 2 WL	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

Source: U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report, 2008*, June 4, 2008.

Notes:

* (WL) indicates placement on Tier 2 Watch List as opposed to Tier 2.

** (a) indicates accession.

Treaties and Protocols:

—U.N. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons

—ILO Convention 105 (Abolition of Forced Labor)

—ILO Convention 182 (Convention on the Worst Forms of Child Labor)

—Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution, and Pornography

—Optional Protocol to the CRC on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict

Author Contact Information

Clare Ribando Seelke
Specialist in Latin American Affairs
cseelke@crs.loc.gov, 7-5229